

Minutes of the 75th CCM Meeting
November 28, 2014

Ministry of Labor, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia

David Sergeenko – CCM Chair, Minister of Labor, Health and Social Affairs

Tamar Gabunia – CCM Vice-Chair, USAID Funded Georgia Tuberculosis Prevention Project, Chief of Party

Amiran Gamkrelidze – NCDCPH, General Director

Nino Kochishvili - EU Delegation, Project Manager

Nino Lomtadze – Coordinator, GEO-T-NCDC Program, on behalf of Mr. Zaza Avaliani – Director of National Center for Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases

Zurab Vadachkoria - Tbilisi State Medical University, Rector

Lasha Tvaliashvili - Real People – Real Vision, Executive Director

Tamar Mirianashvili – Chair of the Board, on behalf of David Mikheil Shubladze – LGBT Georgia, Executive Director

Rusudan Klimiashvili - WHO, Head of Country Office

David Ananiashvili – “Georgian Plus Group”, Director

Tamar Natriashvili – Former TB Patient

Izoleta Bodokia - HIV/AIDS Patients Support Foundation, Director

Archil Talakvadze - Deputy Minister of Correction

Tamaz Marsagishvili - Deputy Minister of Education and Science

Secretariat:

Natia Khonelidze – Administrative Assistant

Guests/observers

Julie Pasquier – GIZ Consultant

Irma Khonelidze – NCDCPH, Deputy Director; GFATM Programs Implementing Unit

Mzia Tabatadze - Program Health and Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist, GFATM/
LFA

Agenda

17:00 – 17:10	<p>Opening speech /remarks</p> <p>Mr. David Sergeenko - CCM Chair, Minister of Labor, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia</p>
17:10 – 17:15	<p>Addressing the members with the request to declare the presence of the Conflict of Interest Secretariat</p>
17:15– 17:45	<p>Presentation of the dashboard/discussion</p> <p>Ms. Julie Pasquier – GIZ Consultant</p> <p>Mr. David Ananiashvili – Chair of the Oversight Committee, “Georgian plus Group”, Director</p>
17:45 – 18:00	<p>Global Fund Projects implementation status</p> <p>Ms. Irma Khonelidze - NCDCPH, Deputy Director</p>
18:00 – 18:15	<p>Status update of preparation of the HIV and TB National strategies and Concept Notes Submission/formation of the working groups</p> <p>Ms. Tamar Gabunia – CCM Vice-Chair, Georgia Tuberculosis Prevention Project, Chief of Party, URC</p>
18:15 – 18:30	<p>Report of the Oversight Committee</p> <p>Mr. David Ananiashvili – Chair of the Oversight Committee, “Georgian plus Group”, Director</p>
18:30 – 19:00	<p>AOB/Announcements</p>

David Sergeenko – greeted the participants and thanked them for coming. The Chairperson raised the issue of selection of the Executive Secretary. Mr. Sergeenko proposed urgently, in a simplified format to search and appoint an appropriate candidate to the position of the executive secretary for a probation period and expressed his readiness to be directly involved in the process.

Tamar Gabunia – agreed with the urgency of the matter and the proposed mechanism.

At the discussion followed the CCM members agreed with the proposal. The desirable timeframe for the execution was set as one week following the date of the CCM Meeting. The CCM Chairperson to be directly involved in the process.

David Sergeenko – gave the floor to **Ms. Natia Khonelidze**.

Natia Khonelidze – addressed the members with the request to declare the presence of the Conflict of Interest if any.

None of the presented members declared the presence of the CoI.

Natia Khonelidze – referred back to the issue of the endorsement of the Improvement Plan and thanked the members for e-mail endorsement received in addition to the fixed signatures on the hard copy of the Improvement Plan obtained at the previous meeting. Ms. Khonelidze addressed the members with the request to fix the signatures on the form printed out from the contact management site.

The presented CCM members fixed their signatures on the Improvement Plan endorsement form (attached).

David Sergeenko – gave the floor to **Ms Julie Pasquier and Mr. David Ananiashvili**.

Julie Pasquier – greeted the participants and reminded them that introduction of the dashboard was one of the Condition Precedents of the GFATM the deadline of which was renegotiated with the GFATM in order to have the first PUs of the newly selected PR in place.

Afterwards Ms. Pasquier presented to the audience the main nature of the oversight and the dashboard tool which is aimed at making the work of the OC more efficient and systematic (the presentation attached). While speaking of the dashboard preparation cycle, Ms. Pasquier stressed that the dashboards for both grants will be produced every three months albeit the PR submits PUDRs to the GFATM every six months. The data entry will be undertaken by the PR. In between the PUDRs the data entered into the dashboard will not be completely validated. The OC will analyze the dashboard and will issue the recommendations to the CCM in order to address the problems identified and prevent possible bottlenecks. The main function of the CCM Secretariat is archiving dashboard. The dashboard has a cumulative nature and the data and findings of the previous period are archived into the dashboard. The first dashboard presents the data of the period 2 of both grants.

David Ananiashvili – thanked Ms. Julie Pasquier for the excellent work and great assistance and presented to the audience the first dashboard for HIV grant developed within the mission. He outlined in details financial, programmatic and management indicators with special focus on the challenges marked in red. Mr. David Ananiashvili rated the procurement of first line drugs as the

matter of the most urgency. The rapporteur gave a positive assessment of the grant implementation by the PR.

The members thoroughly discussed the recommendations derived from the challenges/problems identified and after thorough discussion agreed on the following decisions

HIV grant

#	<i>Key recommendations</i>	<i>Decisions</i>
1	Follow up with PR regarding the preparations for objective 1	The PR reports that implementation of Objective 1 has been rescheduled and implementation will start in IQ of Y2015
2	For ministry to prepare the framework necessary for the national procurement of first line treatment to avoid stock out	Appointment of focal person within the MoLHSA to prepare national procurement of first line drugs
3	Follow up with PR on how to improve Hepatitis C treatment indicator	Meeting with AIDS center and PR for consultation on this issue
4	Urgent appointment of a representative of the MoLHSA within the OC	The ministry will appoint representative
5	Urgent recruitment of the Executive Secretary	Selection and appointment of an appropriate candidate for the position of the Executive Secretary for a probation period
6	Agreement of the CCM on the recommendation of the OC about the transfer of remaining asset procured by former PR	The list of remaining assets will be sent and shall no reaction be gotten from CCM members the assets will remain at the GPIC

The final version of the HIV dashboard agreed at the meeting is attached.

In response to the question regarding the safe storage of GFATM project implementation documents Ms. Irma Khonelidze explained that the preliminary verbal agreement with the GFATM on using the GFATM grant funds for covering the expenses for safe storage is reached. The consultations with the state archive are on-going.

Ms. Tamar Gabunia raised the question regarding appropriateness of reflecting in the dashboard the issues that are not directly linked to the grant implementation and oversight referring to the three issues: appointment of the representative of the OC, appointment of the Executive Secretary and remaining assets. Ms. Pasquier explained that it was done for the

purpose of having in one document all key recommendations though not directly linked to the oversight and that the methodology of the dashboard can be the matter of further discussion within the CCM.

David Ananiashvili –presented to the audience the first dashboard for TB grant and positively assessed the current grant implementation status.

The audience thoroughly discussed presented key recommendations and agreed on the decisions

TB grant

#	Key recommendations	Decisions
1	For MoLHSA to prepare the framework necessary for the national procurement of the first line drugs to avoid stock out	Appointment of focal person within the MoLHSA to prepare national procurement of the first line TB drugs
2	For the OC to analyze the issue of epidemiological data delay and make a recommendation to the CCM	For the OC to analyze the issue of epidemiological data delay and make a recommendation to the CCM

Ms. Gabunia responded to the issue of the TB data delay and stated that the USAID/URC electronic module has been developed and in the process of piloting. She addressed the MoLHSA with the request to facilitate its introduction. The optimistic framework for putting in place the system was identified as 1-1,5 year.

The final version of the TB dashboard agreed at the meeting is attached.

Mzia Tabatadze – raised the question regarding establishment of the TB coordinating authority.

Tamar Gabunia – responded that the Council was created by the Minister’s Order. It is led by the Minister and it comprises with the main TB institutions. The order stipulates the daily operations of the Council will be supported by the National TB Coordinator.

Irma Khonelidze – specified that this is November 11, 2014 01/282 O order.

Tamar Gabunia – asked **Ms Irma Khonelidze** to present current status of GFATM grant implementation.

Irma Khonelidze – updated the audience on the status of GFATM grants

- During the program implementation cycle 92 contracts of State Procurement were signed. The current year tenders are in the process of finalization. On Monday the contracts (duration till the end of the project December 31, 2015) with the HIV program implementers (SRs) selected through the tender will be signed. Ms. Khonelidze brought

to the attention of the attendees to the acuteness of the issue of bank guarantee. As the measure for interim solution of the problem the agreement on the 6 months bank guarantee was reached. Ms. Khonelidze stated that this mechanism contains some risks for the PR and that afore-mentioned concerns the guarantee for implementation of the projects that will last uninterruptedly after the expiration of 6 months period.

- As per GFATM requirement the audit of the 2014 programs to be executed by the 4 leading audit companies (Ernst&Yong, Deloitte and Touche, KPMG International, PricewaterhouseCoopers). The market study has been completed. The interest was expressed by three companies; In addition to the finance audit the procurement, the programmatic part and the program effectiveness will be assessed. The tender will be announced shortly;
- The Condition of nominating TB coordinating mechanism is met;
- The progress towards preparation of the guidelines and protocols regarding new TB drugs, including Bedaquiline is observed due to technical assistance of the USAD funded TB prevention project; having in place of revised protocols and trainings is anticipated by April, 2015;
- National TB program assessment has been conducted by the WHO on November 6-14. It was the first assessment after almost 10 year gap. The preliminary findings were shared with the stakeholders at the meeting conducted at NCDC. WHO experts had meetings with the Minister of Health and Deputy Minister of Corrections. The first report is anticipated by the end of December, the final one is anticipated by the beginning of the year of 2015. The outcomes of the assessment will greatly contribute to the development of post 2015 National TB Strategy and TB Concept Note;
- As reported at the previous CCM meetings the procurement of the Gene expert machines has been a little bit delayed. The Government waiver has been obtained. By the end of January 9 Gene Experts machine should be in the country;
- The TB patients' cash incentive scheme is in place and the substantial progress is observed. Trend in treatment adherence is positive;
- 2015 draft state budget envisages procurement of first line TB drugs and first line ARV drugs;
- The approved order for procurement of ARV drugs (through PPM) covers the stock of 2015 and the buffer of the first 6 months of 2016. The order under the state program should be done no later than in the middle of the next year. This order will cover the needs up to the end of 2017.
- The procurement of pegylated interferon has been done. The indicator for Hepatitis C treatment has been increased from 67% to 70%. The part of the patients refused to receive the treatment in anticipation of the availability of Sofosbuvir.
- The stock out of methadone is unlikely to happen since by the end of December the delivery is anticipated as confirmed by the contractor;

- The cycle of contracting of SRs is in the process of finalization. After that the tender procedure for revealing SRs for objective 1 will be executed;
- The event dedicated to AIDS World Day will be jointly organized by NCDC and PTF;
- Detail explanation regarding the programmatic indicator of the HIV dashboard (Number and percentage of IDUs reached with HIV prevention programmes defined package of services) marked in red (14%) was presented. The low performance in the P1 was caused by delay in the printing of information materials. Currently this component is being performed as planned. Moreover, in consultation with GFATM revisiting of the minimal package is planned for the next reporting period;
- The difference regarding current and safety stocks of syringes marked in red in the dashboard (-1,0) was explained by the fact that procurement of 1 ml syringes was not executed due to absence of interest in response to the study of the market and the tender. The efforts are still made. In addition the syringes are ordered through VPP;

Nino Kochishvili – announced that in October 2014 Mr. Janos Herman was appointed as a Head of EU Delegation to Georgia and raised an issue of shifting CCM membership from Mr. Philip Dimitrov, to Mr. Janos Herman.

The issue was agreed with the presented CCM members.

Tamar Gabunia – presented to the audience the current status of HIV and TB Concept Note (CN) preparation process.

The new submission dates of HIV and TB CNs (April 20, 2015 and July 15, 2015 respectively) were communicated to the CCM by Ms. Alena Alba, GFATM Program Officer. The new dates do not have serious implications to the working process. The preliminary report of WHO National TB Program assessment anticipated by the end of the year will serve as the basis for revisiting TB Strategy and further for TB CN preparation. The selection process of three local experts (Nikoloz Chkahrtishvili, Maia Tsereteli, Nino Tsereteli) to be involved in the revision of the HIV NSP has been completed. The work of the experts will be supported by UN HIV Thematic Group. The selection of the team to provide technical assistance supported by French 5% Initiative is in the process of finalization. Other potential sources for technical assistance are as follows: A) WHO technical support that will be structured around two areas: a) National strategic planning which envisages external review of updated HIV National Strategic Plan (NSP) elaborated with support of the French 5% Initiative and local experts. Mission dates: January – February 2015; b). Review of HIV service delivery model and enabling environment (focusing on key populations) and setting priority areas for interventions for the concept note (as part of the program review). Mission date: February 2015; B) World Bank support in introducing OPTIMA tool. As for external technical assistance for development of TB CN it is already in place and is being provided by USAID. The call for inclusion of local stakeholders in the Working Groups was made by the Secretariat. The e-mail letters to relevant organizations with the request to nominate a representative were sent out. Ms. Gabunia addressed the attendees with

the request to approve the composition of the Working Groups. It was explicitly noted that the Groups are open and the participation of all relevant stakeholders is highly welcomed.

The administrative support to TB Working Group will be provided by the USAID funded TPP. As for the support to HIV Working Group Ms. Gabunia expressed the hope that the engagement of Ms. Ketevan Stvilia as of GFATM HIV program Manager and a highly qualified HIV expert will be ensured.

The members agreed on the composition of the working groups. (The composition of both working groups attached)

Rusudan Klimiashvili – addressed the members with the request to approve the WHO involvement in HIV CN preparation. The details of the TA were shared among the members earlier. The approval of the MoLHSA is needed as well for launching the process. Ms. Klimiashvili outlined the structure and main directions of WHO technical support.

David Sergeenko – welcomed the assistance from the WHO.

The members approved the receipt of the Technical Assistance from WHO.

David Sergeenko – gave the floor to Mr. **David Ananiashvili**.

David Ananiashvili – briefed the audience on the work of the OC with the focus on following issues.

- As per discussions and decisions made at the 74th CCM meeting the MoLHSA was addressed with the request to nominate a person to provide assistance to the OC in the issues of finance expertize, procurement and stock management. The candidacy of Mr. Iliia Tarasashvili, Head of Economic Department of MoLHSA was nominated. The nominee had been agreed upon within the Committee.

The members agreed on the involvement of Mr. Iliia Tarasashvili in the work of OC.

- Low attendance of the OC members at the meetings of the Committee. Mr. Ananiashvili requested the members to be more actively involved.
- The issue of remaining non-monetary assets.

The members reconfirmed the decision made at the meeting.

David Sergeenko – opened the floor for announcements.

Rusudan Klimiashvili – announced that on December 8-12 WHO Consultant will be visiting the country. The purpose of the mission is study of Human Rights component in TB related issues. The mission is organized by WHO EURO as part of the implementation of WHO Regional Platform with USAID.

Mzia Tabatadze – inquired on the current status of the package of TB legislation.

Tamar Gabunia – responded that the draft package has been prepared. Series of the consultations were conducted. The Vice-Chair underlined the importance of the upcoming WHO mission especially in terms of provision of the drug legislation related to involuntary isolation of TB patients. Some consultations with CDC Atlanta were held though the afore-mentioned issue has not been given special consideration.

Mzia Tabatadze – enquired if the issue of involuntary isolation was discussed within in-country stakeholders.

Tamar Gabunia – responded that the package was shared with the Ombudsman's Office.

Due to the absence of the quorum it was decided to circulate by e-mail the decision points of the 75th CCM meeting among all CCM and get electronic endorsement.

David Sergeenko – thanked the members for having attended and announced the meeting as closed.

Decisions:

- 1. Urgently, in a simplified format to search and appoint an appropriate candidate to the position of the Executive Secretary for a probation period. A desirable timeframe for the execution – one week after the CCM meeting; Due to the urgency of the matter CCM Chairperson to be directly involved in the process.**
- 2. Appoint a focal person within the MoLHSA to implement/prepare national regulatory framework necessary for national procurement of first line drugs. Responsible institution – MOLHSA. Timeframe – January 15, 2015;**
- 3. Conduct consultative meetings with the representatives of AIDS center and PR aimed at improved Hepatitis C treatment indicator. Responsible – D. Ananiashvili, Chair of OC. Timeframe – December 20, 2014;**
- 4. Nominate the representative of MoLHSA (Deputy Minister) to the OC as a member. Optimal timeframe – no later than December 20, 2014. Responsible institution – MoLHSA;**

5. **To share with SRs and SSRs the list of GPIC remaining non-monetary assets procured by the Global Fund. Shall no reaction be gotten within 10 days after doing so the assets will remain at GPIC. Responsible – D. Ananiashvili, Chair of OC;**
6. **To conduct site visit to the TB center by OC to analyze the issue of data delay and make a recommendation to the CCM; Responsible – D. Ananiashvili, Chair of OC;**
7. **To endorse the composition of the TB and HIV Concept Notes preparation working groups as per attached document;**
8. **To endorse TA from WHO;** The areas of TA: 1) National strategic planning which envisages external review of updated HIV National Strategic Plan (NSP) elaborated with support of the French 5% Initiative and local experts. 2) Review of HIV service delivery model and enabling environment (focusing on key populations) and setting priority areas for interventions for the concept note (as part of the program review).
9. **To shift the CCM membership from Mr. Philip Dimitrov, Former Head of EU Delegation to Georgia to Mr. Janos Herman due to his appointment as Head of EU Delegation to Georgia, Ambassador;**
10. **To get Mr. Ilia Tarasashvili, Head of Economic Department of MoLHSA involved in OC on a consultative basis to provide assistance in the issues of finance expertize, procurement and stock management;**
11. **To circulate by e-mail the decision point of the 75th CCM meeting among all CCM and get electronic endorsement;**

David Sergeenko

Chairperson

Natia Khonelidze

Administrative Assistant