



**Minutes of the 95th CCM meeting
December 11, 2019**

**Ministry of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and
Social Affairs of Georgia**

Participants

#	CCM Members/Alternates	
1	Ekaterine Tikaradze	CCM Chair, Minister of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia
2	Irma Khonelidze	NCDCPH, Deputy Director General, GFATM PIU, Director
3	Tengiz Tsertsvadze	General Director, Infectious Diseases, AIDS and Clinical Immunology Research Center SR of HIV grant
4	Zaza Avaliani	National Center of Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases, Director SR of TB grant
5	Khatuna Todadze	Center for Mental Health and Prevention of Addiction
6	Guram Amiridze	Ministry of Internal Affairs of Georgia

7	Irine Javakhadze	Ministry of Finance, Budget department/State and consolidated Budget Formulation Division, Chief Specialist
8	Tamta Demurishvili	Ministry of Justice of Georgia Head of Medical Department of Special Penitentiary Service
9	Lela Bakradze	United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA)
10	Nino Kochishvili	EU, Alternate member to Mr. Carl Hartzell , Ambassador, Head of EU Delegation to Georgia
11	Archimandrite Adam – Vakhtang Akhaladze	Head of Public Health Department, Patriarchate of Georgia
12	Zurab Vadachkoria	Rector of Tbilisi State Medical University
13	Elguja Meladze	Employers' Association of Georgia, President
14	Konstantine Labartkava	GenPUD, CBO New Vector, KAP IDU SSR for HIV grant
15	Gocha Gabodze	MSM Community, Alternate member to David Kakhaveri
16	Mzia Tabatadze	NGO Alternative Georgia OC Chair
17	Zaza Karchkhadze	NGO New Way SR of HIV grant
18	Mari Chokheli	Open Society – Georgia Foundation Programs Manager
19	David Jikia	Patients Union Alternate member to Nikoloz Mirzashvili
20	Lela Tsakadze	TB KAP Winners Club

#	Guests/Observers/Speakers	
21	Tamar Gabunia	Deputy Minister of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia, PAAC Chair
22	Tim A. Clary	EHG Consultant
23	Sanja Matovic	EHG Consultant
24	Maka Danelia	NCDCPH, PIU, TB Program Manager
25	Nana Nabakhteveli	LFA, UNOPS, Finance Expert
26	Tornike Khonelidze	Office of the State Minister of Georgia for Reconciliation and Civic Equality
27	Mariam Ubilava	NGO Mandala
28	Nikolo Gviniashvili	Equality Movement, HIV Prevention Program Assistant
29	Lasha Abesadze	CBO New Vector, IDU community
30	Konstantine Rukhadze	CBO New Vector, GenPUD, IDU community
#	Secretariat	
31	Irina Grdzeldze	Executive Secretary
32	Natia Khonelidze	Administrative Assistant

Agenda

15:00 – 15:10	Opening speech /remarks/ endorsement of the minutes of 94th CCM meeting/endorsement of the agenda Ms. Ekaterine Tikaradze - Minister of Internally Displaced Persons from the Occupied Territories, Labour, Health and Social Affairs of Georgia
15:10– 15:15	Addressing the members with the request to declare the presence of the Conflict of Interest Secretariat
15:15 – 15:25	HIV and TB grants implementation status Ms. Irma Khonelidze – NCDCPH Deputy Director, GFATM PIU Project Director

15:25 – 15:30	Report on Oversight activities Ms. Mzia Tabatadze – Chair of Oversight Committee
15:30 – 16:05	Update on current initiatives regarding the CCMs evolution /Review of revised Governance Manual/Discussion Mr. Tim A. Clary – EHG Consultant Ms. Sanja Matovic-Miljanovic - EHG Consultant
16:05 – 16:25	Presentation of the results of CCM self-assessment/capacity building areas/discussion Mr. Tim A. Clary – EHG Consultant Ms. Sanja Matovic-Miljanovic - EHG Consultant
16:25 – 16:45	Presentation of orientation material/ discussion of any remote support to be provided (January April 2020) Mr. Tim A. Clary – EHG Consultant Ms. Sanja Matovic-Miljanovic - EHG Consultant
16:45– 16:55	Handover of Transition Plan to G-CCM Mr. Tim A. Clary – EHG Consultant Ms. Sanja Matovic-Miljanovic - EHG Consultant
16:55- 17:00	AOB/announcements
17:00	Closure of the meeting

Ekaterine Tikaradze– greeted the participants, underlined efficient format of CCM functioning and active role of the CCM members and announced the 95th CCM meeting as opened. The Chairperson addressed members with the request to announce the topics to be additionally included into the agenda (if any), to declare the presence of the Conflict of Interest (if any) with the purpose not to jeopardize upcoming elaborations and discussions.

The agenda of the 95th CCM meeting was endorsed. The COI with regard to agenda items was not declared by any members present at the meeting. The COI forms were filled out and kept at the CCM Office. The minutes of the 94th CCM meeting was endorsed.

Mr. Tim Clary and Ms. Sanja Matovic were asked to present one more time a brief overview of the current mission.

Tim Clary – he has been working with Georgia CCM since 2011. As EHG consultants, Tim Clary and Sanja Matovic have been working with Georgia CCM since 2016 as part of a GIZ-supported initiative to provide technical support to CCMs globally. The focus is evolution of CCMs after the Global Fund’s phase out from the countries. The outstanding position of Georgia CCM in terms of its maturity level and efficiency was underlined. Though it’s the last visit of the consultants within the framework of current assignment, to hand over the CCM transition Plan to the CCM and implement other components of TA, a remote support can be provided in the period through April 2019. At today’s meeting the consultants will:

present proposed modifications to the Governance Manual, present potential revisions to the orientation package, hand over the CCM transition plan, present the results of the self-assessment, update the CCM on current initiatives regarding the CCMs evolution. Mr. Clary highly emphasized the results of the CCM self-assessment.

Ekaterine Tikaradze – thanked the consultants. The results of the work are important for the county and for the Ministry. The Chairperson highly emphasized the importance of each constituency presented at the CCM; the intellectual property accumulated within the CCM represents a powerful tool to continue further development and evolution in the right directions chosen with assistance of the consultants. The Chairperson expressed strong belief that the effective work will be continued by means of the remote support.

Tamar Gabunia – thanked the consultants and highly emphasized the importance of work undertaken by them. The Transition Plan as well as other recommendations elaborated will serve as effective tools to help the CCM to make the successful transition and ensure its sustainability after the Global Fund phase out.

Ekaterine Tikaradze – gave the floor to Ms. Irma Khonelidze. The Chairperson apologized and announced that she has to leave a meeting for a while. During her absence the meeting will be led by Ms. Tamar Gabunia.

Irma Khonelidze – expressed her gratitude to the Minister, Ms. Ekaterine Tikaradze for supporting the procedures needed for GoG approval of TB grant agreement. The document had been already signed by all parties and the implementation will start on January 1, 2020. Ms. Khonelidze one more time briefly overviewed all main component of the grant agreement. The activities of grants are on-going per the plan set. The rapporteur focused on Zero TB Initiative in Adjara Region comprehensively discussed at the previous CCM meeting and announced that a vehicle equipped with digital X-Ray and AI had been delivered to the country; the GeneXpert can be installed into the vehicle. The vehicle will be used in Adjara region and is anticipated to be gradually rolled out to the regions. The work had been undertaken in close collaboration with TB Association and with involvement of the consultant. The additional TA is anticipated from January, 2020. The work for successful completion of the tender procedures under HIV grant to ensure uninterrupted service provision for the year of 2020 had been prioritized. Ms. Irma Khonelidze referred back to the tender for procurement of the computers to be completed by December 25 and focused on the topic of hand over of some assets procured under the GF grants stating that this topic can be more comprehensively discussed at the next CCM meeting. The rapporteur briefly outlined the past experience of handing over the assets procured within the Global Fund grants. The request of NCDC to hand over computers to PHC service providers implementing integrated screening not been approved by the GF. Currently the communication regarding transfer of the UVGI lights to end users is on-going. The NCDC fully realizes the responsibilities of each party involved in utilization. In case of positive response from the Global Fund the CCM will be addressed with the request to review and make a final decision.

Tamar Gabunia – asked the audience to address Ms. Khonelidze with questions if any and gave the floor to Ms. Mzia Tabatadze.

Mzia Tabatadze – presented main aspects of the oversight activities of the recent period and plans set. The Oversight Committee had reviewed and discussed HIV and TB dashboards for 2019 Q3 (OC meeting, December 6, 2019). No significant underachievement/delays had been identified; the activities are on-gong as per the plan set. The expansion of the coverage with GeneXperts had been discussed by OC. The involvement of 15 general profile clinics was positively assessed by the rapporteur. It was noted that reduction in TB in parallel with improved TB detection, indicates the success of the TB program. In recent past there was some challenge regarding validation of syphilis tests, however, the issue received due attention from NCDC and it has been already addressed at the moment. The Oversight Committee conducted two site visits on November 21: HIV/AIDS Patients Support Foundation and TB people. During the meeting with HIV/AIDS Patients Support Foundation, both - the staff and beneficiaries expressed their concerns with regard to reduced budget. The new office space, due to its smaller size, does not ensure having private and confidential atmosphere during the consultations for PLHIV; support services for HIV infected people, family members and HIV-infected children have been downscaled. As it was stated during the site visit, the Foundation currently covers approximately 1/3 of the cohort of infected people; peer-counseling for newly diagnosed PLHIV is conducted every Monday at the AIDS Center, and this approach has been positively assessed by the NGO staff and beneficiaries. The Foundation and its activities are solely financed by the Global Fund and sustainability of the services offered by the Foundation may be at risk. The rapporteur emphasized the importance of intensifying advocacy to engage local municipalities in financing support services for PLHIV. The fact that Tbilisi and Batumi city mayors signed the Paris Declaration should be used as an advocacy instrument. She also stressed the importance of engaging private and business sector and referred back to the charity exhibition held last year to mark World AIDS Day, when two companies – Alta, and Nikora granted HIV infected persons with special discount vouchers; she expressed her gratitude towards them and noted that such activities should get more visibility to become exemplary for other representatives of business sector. The issue of HIV-related stigma and discrimination in healthcare sector was discussed during the site visit. It had been noted that majority of cases came to the years of 2017 and 2018. Ms. Tabatadze named several clinics in which, according to PLHIV respondents, stigmatizing attitude from healthcare personnel was observed. She added that though the OC did not have the possibility to verify the information, the CCM members should be on alert. The beneficiaries named absence of transportation allowance as a barrier to treatment for some patients. The beneficiaries had expressed their deep appreciation and gratefulness towards the AIDS Center for high quality treatment and positive attitude from medical personnel. The infrastructural issues existing at AIDS Center had been named as a challenge by the beneficiaries. Ms. Tabatadze especially emphasized the issue of ARV treatment adherence and underlined the high need of engaging specialized psychologists. The issue had become vivid during the meeting with the beneficiaries at the Foundation, where a concrete example of one HIV+ child (under 15) was brought to the OC attention: the child did not adhere ARV treatment because of negative influence from non-treatment-adherent HIV+ mother. Ms. Tabatadze stressed that the family did not receive professional psychological support, and emphasized that it was due to the absence of qualified child psychologists trained in HIV/AIDS issues in Georgia. She addressed the audience with the request to urgently address the issue. During the site visit to the NGO “TB People”, the OC team met with representatives of various organizations supporting the NGO. Major activities implemented under the two programs: The Sustainability of Services for Key Populations in Easter Europe and Central Asia Region (SoS Project), and TB REP 2.0. The main activities implemented by TB People include community empowerment, awareness raising, budget advocacy, community monitoring. The mobile application for TB patients was ranked as a very important and promising innovation by the rapporteur.

Major points from the discussion:

Elguja Meladze - as a representative of private sector in the CCM referred to the topic of charity work raised by Ms. Tabatadze and stated that there are lots of other entities besides those named by Ms. Tabatadze would be willing to be involved and actually involved in charity work. Though these charity activities are not widely publicly available. The CCM is a powerful platform for identifying needs and streamlining these activities. The Association represented by Mr. Meladze has very well structured coordination with other business associations; thus coordination at all levels can be ensured. He also expressed his readiness to cooperate during tender procedures with the purpose to identify the most reliable implementer.

Mari Chokheli – referred to the issue of child psychologists. In order to urgently react to the issue of the concrete family raised by Ms. Tabatadze, she offered her support to get in contact with the Partnership for Human Rights and Child Rights Center at the Ombudsman’s Office where child psychological services are available. She expressed her readiness to communicate and coordinate this issue.

Gocha Gabodze – stated that the private sector should be focused on social responsibility in terms of HIV/AIDS, TB and other diseases versus charity work which at some extent deepens stigma. Addressing of adherence represents a matter of paramount importance. The importance of involvement of patients themselves while addressing the issues and planning the adherence programs was highly emphasized.

Elguja Meladze – noted that the initiatives of business sector to be based on the recommendations of the professionals. He stated that activities of ILO working in partnership with the Ministry include large component of HIV/AIDS envisaging capacity building, employment, labor relations for HIV infected people and other interventions.

Tamar Gabunia – highly emphasized the role of the patients and of their involvement. This topic was also covered during the TAG meeting. There are examples of other countries which successfully introduced the model into their system. Thus more work directed towards recognition, institutionalization, identification of the source of financing of this service to be undertaken.

Tengiz Tsertsvadze – AIDS Center spares no efforts to create the most possible favorable environment for the patients, to constantly improve functionality and to implement all feasible innovatory proposals. Very important steps had been undertaken during last 6 months. The representatives of the AIDS Center visited leading AIDS Centers abroad and the AIDS Center hosted the representatives of other leading institutions with purpose of experience sharing and improvement of current situation, Prof. Tsertsvade addressed Ms. Mzia Tabatadze with the request to meet with the representatives of AIDS Center to comprehensively discuss all acute issues such as adherence, facts of HIV related stigma and discrimination in some clinics, child psychological services to identify realistic corrective measures directed toward establishment of the most optimal model. Prof. Tsertsvade addressed the audience with the request to come up with notions/ideas, innovatory proposals. All of them will be thoroughly studied and introduced in case of feasibility and optimality. Every little bit counts, and none of the recommendations will be left without due consideration. The challenges related to physical infrastructure, are beyond the mandate of the AIDS Center; these issues have been discussed at the governmental level with the purpose to identify solution throughout the years.

Tamar Gabunia – thanked the audience for active discussion and gave the floor to Mr. Tim Clary and Ms. Sanja Matovic.

Sanja Matovic- updated the audience on current initiatives regarding the CCMs evolution (presentation attached). The retrospective analysis of the CCMs establishment and history, prerequisites for launching the evolution initiative were presented. While speaking of the CCMs evolution it was noted that some CCMs like Georgia CCM had reached strategic maturity level being one AIDS, TB Malaria authority, overseeing not only the Global Fund programs but National Programs. In 2018 the Global Fund launched CCM evolution project, piloted in 18 countries in 2018/2019. The four focus areas of participating CCMs support (functionality, oversight, engagement, linkages) were presented and described. The key project milestones were presented. The base line assessment had been followed by the provision of the TA by various consultant teams and then by the end line assessment. The whole initiative including the results of the assessment were presented to the Global Fund Board in November, 2019. While briefly overviewing the results, the high level of Georgia CCM maturity falling into strategic level was underlined versus most of other CCMs showing functional or engaged level and some CCMs with the level falling into “working towards functional” category. The planned next steps of the process were specified as follows: rolling out of the initiative to 115 countries globally (2020-2022); launching in 90 countries in 2020 (subject to the amount of funding available for catalytic investments). The information on potential enrolment of Georgia in the process in 2020 is not available right now and can be obtained through Fund Portfolio Manager. The TA to Georgia during this period was provided by GIZ; the results will be presented to GIZ in the first quarter of 2020 and there is anticipation that the results will be used for CCM evolution initiative. Georgia CCM will be updated once the new information is available, supposedly at the beginning of next year.

Tim Clary – presented main proposed modification to the Governance Manual revised with the purpose to bring the document better in line with changing Global Fund policy and procedure and to better respond to the realities of management of CCM (the presentation attached). The CCM will be eventually asked to ratify the propose changes.

The proposed revisions:

- Two functions: approval of reprogramming requests and assurance of linkages between the GF grants and other national health and development programs were added to CCM mandate;
- Healthcare and Social Issues Committee of the Parliament of Georgia (within government sector) was added as a permanent member (within government sector);
- Member terms are now three years (without limitation to elect the same member if the constituency decides so);
- All members are expected to have an alternate except the Chair and Vice Chair
- If a new bilateral or multilateral partner requests to join the G-CCM and that sector approves, it can do so without an (s)election, according to their internal procedures;
- If both the regular and alternate G-CCM are in attendance at a G-CCM meeting, only the regular member has voting rights;
- If the G-CCM is unable to meet (quorum or other issue), members can vote electronically;
- If the OC Chair or other OC members are not able to provide an update on oversight, the G-CCM Secretariat may do so;

- The minutes of the G-CCM meetings may be approved electronically;
- The Chair and Vice Chair can be elected electronically;
- If the Chair or Vice Chair are not present to preside the G-CCM meeting, the PAAC Chair or OC Chair may do so;
- The Chair will serve for a term of four years and can be re-elected for another term if CCM decides so;
- The Oversight Committee is responsible for overseeing the implementation of the CCM Transition Plan;
- The PAAC has a role in the implementation of the G-CCM Transition Plan (as defined by the Transition Action Plan), as well as, in the development of NSPs and funding requests;
- The Conflict of Interest Policy has been replaced by the Georgia CCM Code of Conduct, Ethics, and Conflict of Interest Policy.

The revised Governance Manual will be distributed among CCM for additional review, feedback and approval.

Afterwards Mr. Tim Clary presented the results of the CCM self-assessment (the presentation attached). The rationale behind conducting self-assessment: the results will inform the need for development of the capacity building plan and its main directions. The questionnaire consisted of 20 quantitative questions based on the CCM Evolution baseline assessment tool and 1 qualitative comment box (5 comments received). 15 questionnaires received (52% response rate). The filled out questionnaires were sent directly to the consultants to observe confidentiality. The results of the self-assessment were presented and analysed. It was noted that according to the results no gaps had been identified. The audience was addressed with the request to additionally raise issues, capacity gaps and areas if any.

Tamar Gabunia – noted that tremendous efforts put into the strengthening of the CCM and accumulated experience helped to achieve such impressive results.

Sanja Matovic – referred to the results of self-assessment and noted that the results one more time revealed the strength of Georgia CCM and no immediate need for development of capacity building plan and provision of capacity building. The different orientation packages were overviewed (presentation attached) such as: for new CCM members - basic orientation package; for all CCM members – continuous orientation, updates and refreshment (annually and/or based on needs assessment); for targeted constituencies – specific modules (when/if needed and based on needs assessment); for addressing particular issues – specific modules (when/if needed). The components of each orientation package were presented in details. As for development of Georgia CCM orientation material it was noted that basic G-CCM orientation package will be revised and adapted by the consultants (under GIZ project). Further based on needs assessment (through questionnaire shared with the CCM) selected specific orientation materials might be developed. The results of quick assessment will help the consultants to additionally identify and target other needs through the remote assistance which will cover the period of January-April 2020. In addition, the Global Fund provides TA in the following areas of orientation: orientation of new members, strengthening governance and

preparing for transition, oversight strengthening, civil society engagement and elections. The Global Fund can provide assistance online through webinars, after which the teams of consultants can be sent to the countries. Finally, Ms. Matovic one more time asked the members to fill out the questionnaires. The analysis of the questionnaire will enable the consultants to come up with the suggestions and to update the existing orientation module by the beginning of next year.

Tamar Gabunia - thanked Ms. Matovic, positively assessed the benefits of using on-line platform and gave the floor to Mr. Clary.

Tim Clary – briefly overviewed the process of TA starting from 2016, congratulated Georgia with prolonged Global Fund support. He expressed his gratitude to Georgia CCM for being proactive, cooperative and efficient during the work of the consultant which greatly contributed to the success of the assignment. The Transition/Action Plan developed by the consultants will be properly utilized and will serve as an effective tool for successful transitioning and sustainability.

The audience applauded.

Tamar Gabunia – expressed deep gratitude to the consultants. Their recommendations are of outmost importance for Georgia CCM which evolved as an effective and useful platform ensuring participation of all partners and which serves as the best model for coordination and involvement in the country. Ms. Gabunia expressed satisfaction and underlined the importance of continuous support of the Global Fund.

Natia Khonelidze - briefly overviewed the PAAC meeting held on December 10. The participants of the PAAC meeting had also expressed their full satisfaction, gratitude toward the consultants and the wish to continue receiving support from their side.

Tamar Gabunia – announced that UHC Council to lead the process of planned reforms in healthcare sector are being established. Some of the members of the CCM had been addressed with the request to nominate the representatives. First Deputy Minister highly emphasised the importance of involvement of community organizations, patients themselves, Patients Union and requested the audience to express their interest through the CCM Secretariat.

Mari Chokheli - stated that Healthcare Advocacy Coalition with CIF acting as the Secretariat can nominate one representative to be included into the Council and expressed her readiness to coordinate the nomination process from the Coalition.

Konstantine Labartkava – addressed the Deputy Minister with the request to move forward with regard to establishment of working group to deal with the problems faced by the IDU community.

Tamar Gabunia - requested Mr. Labartkava to nominate the representatives while the Ministry will nominate the representatives from its side. Deputy Minister one more time thanked the consultants, all the participants for active participation and announced the meeting as closed.

CCM Chair

CCM Administrative Assistant